Notice of Standards Committee

Date: Tuesday, 20 June 2023 at 6.00 pm

Venue: Committee Room, First Floor, BCP Civic Centre Annex, St Stephen's Rd, Bournemouth BH2 6LL

Membership:

Chairman:

Vice Chairman:

Cllr A Chapmanlaw	Cllr R Maidment	Cllr O Walters
Cllr E Connolly	Cllr B Nanovo	
Cllr M Haines	Cllr V Ricketts	

Independent persons:

Mr P Cashmore Mr I Sibley Mr J Storey	Mr P Cashmore	Mr I Sibley	Mr J Storey
---------------------------------------	---------------	-------------	-------------

All Members of the Standards Committee are summoned to attend this meeting to consider the items of business set out on the agenda below.

The press and public are welcome to view the live stream of this meeting at the following link:

https://democracy.bcpcouncil.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?MId=5598

If you would like any further information on the items to be considered at the meeting please email bob.hanton@bcpcouncil.gov.uk

Press enquiries should be directed to the Press Office: Tel: 01202 118686 or email press.office@bcpcouncil.gov.uk

This notice and all the papers mentioned within it are available at democracy.bcpcouncil.gov.uk

GRAHAM FARRANT CHIEF EXECUTIVE







12 June 2023



Maintaining and promoting high standards of conduct

Declaring interests at meetings

Familiarise yourself with the Councillor Code of Conduct which can be found in Part 6 of the Council's Constitution.

Before the meeting, read the agenda and reports to see if the matters to be discussed at the meeting concern your interests



What are the principles of bias and pre-determination and how do they affect my participation in the meeting?

Bias and predetermination are common law concepts. If they affect you, your participation in the meeting may call into question the decision arrived at on the item.

Predetermination Test
it d vas that ?

If a councillor appears to be biased or to have predetermined their decision, they must NOT participate in the meeting.

For more information or advice please contact the Monitoring Officer (susan.zeiss@bcpcouncil.gov.uk)

Selflessness

Councillors should act solely in terms of the public interest

Integrity

Councillors must avoid placing themselves under any obligation to people or organisations that might try inappropriately to influence them in their work. They should not act or take decisions in order to gain financial or other material benefits for themselves, their family, or their friends. They must declare and resolve any interests and relationships

Objectivity

Councillors must act and take decisions impartially, fairly and on merit, using the best evidence and without discrimination or bias

Accountability

Councillors are accountable to the public for their decisions and actions and must submit themselves to the scrutiny necessary to ensure this

Openness

Councillors should act and take decisions in an open and transparent manner. Information should not be withheld from the public unless there are clear and lawful reasons for so doing

Honesty & Integrity

Councillors should act with honesty and integrity and should not place themselves in situations where their honesty and integrity may be questioned

Leadership

Councillors should exhibit these principles in their own behaviour. They should actively promote and robustly support the principles and be willing to challenge poor behaviour wherever it occurs

AGENDA

Items to be considered while the meeting is open to the public

1. Apologies

To receive any apologies for absence from Members.

2. Substitute Members

To receive information on any changes in the membership of the Committee.

Note – When a member of a Committee is unable to attend a meeting of a Committee or Sub-Committee, the relevant Political Group Leader (or their nominated representative) may, by notice to the Monitoring Officer (or their nominated representative) prior to the meeting, appoint a substitute member from within the same Political Group. The contact details on the front of this agenda should be used for notifications.

3. Election of Chair

To elect a Chair of the Standards Committee for the 2023/24 municipal year.

4. Election of Vice-Chair

To elect a Vice-Chair of the Standards Committee for the 2023/24 municipal year.

5. Declarations of Interests

Councillors are requested to declare any interests on items included in this agenda. Please refer to the workflow on the preceding page for guidance.

Declarations received will be reported at the meeting.

6. Confirmation of Minutes

To confirm and sign as a correct record the minutes of the Meeting held on 13 March 2023.

7. Public Issues

To receive any public questions, statements or petitions submitted in accordance with the Constitution. Further information on the requirements for submitting these is available to view at the following link:-

https://democracy.bcpcouncil.gov.uk/ieListMeetings.aspx?CommitteeID=15 1&Info=1&bcr=1

The deadline for the submission of public questions is 4 clear working days before the meeting.

The deadline for the submission of a statement is midday the working day before the meeting.

The deadline for the submission of a petition is 10 working days before the

5 - 8

meeting.

8. Code of Conduct Complaints - Review

The Committee is responsible for maintaining high standards of conduct by Members of BCP Council and the Town and Parish Councils, monitoring the operation of the Code of Conduct, and considering the outcome of commissioned independent investigations.

The report provides Members with an update on complaints regarding alleged breaches of the Code of Conduct against Councillors received or concluded since the last report to the Committee in February 2023.

No other items of business can be considered unless the Chairman decides the matter is urgent for reasons that must be specified and recorded in the Minutes.

BOURNEMOUTH, CHRISTCHURCH AND POOLE COUNCIL

STANDARDS COMMITTEE

Minutes of the Meeting held on 13 March 2023 at 10.00 am

Present:-

Cllr D Borthwick – Chairman

Cllr D Kelsey – Vice-Chairman

Cllr M Andrews and Independent Persons Mr P Cashmore and Mr I Sibley

27. <u>Apologies</u>

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors A Filer, A Jones, L Northover and V Ricketts.

28. <u>Substitute Members</u>

Formal notification had been received appointing Councillor D Flagg as substitute for Councillor V Ricketts.

29. <u>Declarations of Interests</u>

Councillor D Borthwick and Councillor D Kelsey both declared an interest in Complaint Reference BCP121 and advised the Committee that should that complaint be discussed they would leave the meeting during consideration of the item.

30. <u>Public Issues</u>

The Committee was advised of the receipt of two Public Statements.

Public Statement from Mr Alexander McKinstry

Public Statement

I was appalled, studying today's report, to see councillors treating this Committee almost like an afterthought. One subject councillor overlooked three letters from this Committee (including the outcome letter) and is now introducing "fresh evidence" six months down the line. In Complaint 108, the councillor announced she "would not be available" for this Committee, while in 126, the councillor used a publicly-funded officer to discuss the complaint, then did not attend a related meeting. Full Council (21 March) looks to tighten up response times to this Committee; I certainly think this would be a step in the right direction.

Public Statement from Ms Sarah Boyce

Public Statement

Cllr Filer stated at a meeting of this Committee last year that some councillors seemed to be treating Standards as a game. She pointed out

too how the Committee tended to deal with serious complaints only, since an initial assessment is conducted by the Monitoring Officer. It reflects very poorly on this Council, therefore, to see how several councillors have failed to comply with sanctions imposed by this Committee recently, and in the absence of any compelling new evidence, notices of non-compliance at the next Council might be the best way of resolving these complaints.

31. <u>Code of Conduct Complaints - Review</u>

The Committee received the regular schedule of completed and ongoing complaints against Councillors with cases shown as closed in the previous report removed from the list. It was noted that, although it had only been a period of just over a week since the last meeting of the Committee, an informal consultation meeting had taken place and progress was noted.

It was particularly noted that Complaint Reference BCP121 had been deferred and would be considered at the next meeting of the Committee.

The adopted arrangements for dealing with allegations of breach of the Code of Conduct were set out. These included the arrangements for initial assessment by the Monitoring Officer and the process for determination of complaints by the Chair of the Standards Committee in consultation with Councillors of the Standards Committee and the Independent Persons.

The Committee reviewed the table of complaints setting out, in each case, the nature of the complaint and, where applicable, the Monitoring Officer's assessment, the decision of the Chair and the current status of the complaint.

The report highlighted a number of complaints where Councillors had not complied with a determination made by the Chair of the Standards Committee following the process of informal resolution. The differing circumstances in respect of each of the quoted complaints were set out within the agenda and explained. Specifically this related to complaints under references BCP 97; 105; 108; 110 and 126.

Committee were made aware that should they wish to receive further detail on any of the complaints in addition to the information provided in the report this could be provided in confidential (exempt) business. Members of the Committee confirmed, however, that they were familiar with the facts in each case. The Committee nevertheless expressed its concerns about the delay in resolving complaints and obtaining responses from subject Councillors all of which was highlighted as being particularly unfair on the public waiting to hear resolution of their complaints.

The report presented a range of options for addressing delays and the consequential undermining of the role and standing of the Standards Committee. It was particularly noted that a number of the individual complaints reported as unresolved were the result of Councillors not accepting a determination made at the informal resolution stage.

After discussion it was proposed by Councillor M Andrews and seconded by Councillor D Kelsey

RESOLVED that, in respect of complaint references BCP 105; 108; 110 and 126, a report on non-compliance by the individual subject Councillors be made to the meeting of full Council on 21 March 2023 subject to each of the subject Councillors affected being given an opportunity to make a public apology at the commencement of the Council meeting and subject also to the apology also being submitted in writing ahead of the meeting.

Voting – Unanimous

The Independent Persons present at the meeting indicated their support for this approach and underlined the loss of public credibility that was being caused by non-compliance.

The Committee also discussed the question of how an apology should be delivered if a subject Councillor was not present at the Council meeting and, whilst accepting that there was no formal policy, the Committee were of the view that in such a case the apology should be read out by the appropriate Political Group Leader.

In concluding its meeting, the Committee discussed the current process for dealing with complaints made under the Code and there was consensus that there was a need, going forward, to address how the drawn out process currently being applied could be speeded up. At the request of the Committee, the Monitoring Officer accordingly undertook to commence, after the forthcoming Council elections, a review through the Constitution Review Working Group of the current Constitutional provisions relating to Code of Conduct investigations.

Although the meeting had been necessary held during the morning in order to be able to meet the deadline for the full Council, Members noted their support for the usual start time of 6pm.

The meeting ended at 10.28 am

CHAIRMAN

This page is intentionally left blank

Agenda Item 8

STANDARDS COMMITTEE



Report subject	Code of Conduct Complaints - Review
Meeting date	20 th June 2023
Status	Public Report
Executive summary	This report provides Members with an update on complaints regarding alleged breaches of the Code of Conduct against councillors received or concluded since the last report to the Committee in February 2023. There continued to be a high number of complaints but this report demonstrates that the efforts in place to address these has had an impact on the numbers that are now resolved.
	The Committee is responsible for maintaining high standards of conduct by Members of BCP Council and the Town and Parish Councils, monitoring the operation of the Code of Conduct, and considering the outcome of commissioned independent investigations.
Recommendations	It is RECOMMENDED that:
	the outcome of concluded complaints and the progress of those still outstanding be noted.
Reason for recommendations	This is an opportunity for Members of the Committee to be appraised of details of completed complaints and any outstanding complaints of alleged breaches against the Code of Conduct. This is in accordance with the functions of the Committee and its duty to discharge functions in relation to the promotion and maintenance of high standards of conduct within the Council and amongst Town and Parish Councils within the area.
Portfolio Holder(s):	Not applicable
Corporate Director	Graham Farrant
Report Authors	Ingrid Brown (Head of Legal Services) Richard Jones (Head of Democratic Services)
Wards	Not applicable

Background

- 1. The purpose of this report is to provide a summary and update of completed and ongoing complaints received regarding alleged breaches of the Code of Conduct under the Localism Act 2011 against Councillors for the Bournemouth, Christchurch and Poole area, including parish and town councils.
- 2. A similar report has been presented to previous meetings of the committee and now forms a regular item at committee meetings.

Analysis

- 3. Details of allegations/complaints in relation to the Code of Conduct are outlined in the table set out in paragraph 9 to this report. Cases which were shown as closed in the previous report have been removed from this report.
- 4. The adopted arrangements for dealing with allegations of breach of the code of conduct for councillors now provides for an initial assessment by the Monitoring Officer, who may, if appropriate:

(a) reject the complaint on the grounds that it falls outside the scope of a valid Code of Conduct complaint;

(b) determine that there is no breach of the Code and no further action should be taken; or

(c) where considered appropriate, enter into an early preliminary and informal dialogue with the complainant and the Councillor complained of, and agree a speedy informal resolution of the complaint

(d) refer the complaint to the Chair of Standards Committee for consideration...

5. Where complaints proceed to the Chair of the Standards Committee (in consultation with councillors of the Standards Committee, the Independent Persons and the Monitoring Officer (or their Deputy)), the Chair may decide whether:-

There is no breach of the Code and no further action should be taken; or

There is a potential breach of the Code and informal resolution is appropriate, to include for example mediation, training, apology, advice; or

There is a potential breach of the Code and the Monitoring Officer should undertake or commission an investigation into the complaint with a view to a report then being considered by the Standards Committee.

- 6. The table contained in this report provides information about of the nature of the complaint, the assessment of the Monitoring Officer (where appropriate), the decision of the Chair (following consultation), any informal resolutions determined by Chair (where applicable), and the status of the complaint at the date of the report
- 7. Certain specific detailed information regarding pending complaints has not been provided as this may be prejudicial to the conduct of the ongoing complaints process. Personal details have also not been included to protect both the identity of the subject councillors and the complainant, unless specific direction to the contrary has been expressed.

8. There continued to be a large number of complaints. The regular and scheduled consultation meetings meant that it has been possible to resolve many of these in a much timelier manner.

9.	Table	1

Reference	Nature of allegation	Outcome / Decision	Status
BCP-097	 Failing to treat others with respect Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity Using or attempting to use the position as a Councillor improperly to confer on or secure an advantage or disadvantage for him or herself or anyone else 	The complaint was initially assessed by the Monitoring Officer and was then to be referred to the Chair for consideration in consultation. Complainant advised. Subject Councillor to apologise in writing. Subject Councillor requested a review of the outcome. Review upheld the complaint and the subject Councillor was advised and asked if that the remedy by way of an apology now be complied with.	Waiting confirmation from subject Councillor that has/intends to apologise.
BCP-105	 Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity 	The complaint was initially assessed by the Monitoring Officer and was then considered by the Chair in consultation. The decision of the Chair was communication to the subject Councillor and to the Complainant. Subject Councillor to	Determined. Non- compliance with remedy referred to Full Council on 21 st March 2023.
BCP-108	 Failing to treat others with respect Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity 	The complaint was initially assessed by the Monitoring Officer and referred to the Chair for consideration in consultation on 4 th January 2023 Complaint upheld and Subject Councillor to be asked to apologise.	Determined. Subject Councillor apologised at Full Council

Reference	Nature of allegation	Outcome / Decision	Status
		The decision of the Chair was communicated to the Subject Councillor and to the Complainant.	
BCP-110	 Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity 	Complaint considered by the Monitoring officer and then referred to the Chair for consideration in consultation. Chair determined that the complaint be upheld and that the subject Councillor should make a formal apology. The decision of the Chair was communicated to the Complainant and to the Subject Councillor	Determined. Report presented to Full Council for failure to comply with remedy.
BCP-112	 Failing to treat others with respect Failing to have regard to the Council's Code of Publicity. 	Complaint reviewed by Monitoring Officer and by Chair following consultation. Not upheld	Determined
BCP-113	 Failing to treat others with respect Intimidating of attempting to intimidate Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity 	Complaint reviewed by Monitoring Officer and by Chair following consultation. Not upheld	Determined
BCP-114	Failing to treat others with respect	Complaint reviewed by Monitoring Officer and	Determined

Reference	Nature of allegation	Outcome / Decision	Status
	 Intimidating of attempting to intimidate Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity 	by Chair following consultation. Not Upheld	
BCP-115	 Failing to have regard to the Council's Code of Publicity. Failing to declare the existence and nature of a personal interest 	Complaint reviewed by Monitoring Officer and by Chair following consultation. Not upheld	Determined
BCP-116	 Failing to have regard to the Council's Code of Publicity 	Complaint reviewed by Monitoring Officer and by Chair following consultation. Not Upheld	Determined
BCP-117	Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity	Complaint reviewed by Monitoring Officer and by Chair following consultation.	Determined
BCP-118	 Failing to treat others with respect Intimidating or attempting to intimidate Failing to have regard to the Council's Code of Publicity. 	Complaint reviewed by Monitoring Officer and by Chair following consultation. Not Upheld	Determined
BCP-119	Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity	The complaint was assessed by the Monitoring Officer and will be referred to the Chair for consideration in consultation on.	Determined Review- Pending

Reference	Nature of allegation	Outcome / Decision	Status
		Complaint not upheld by the Chair. Complainant and Subject Councillor advised.	
		Complainant sought a review. Review to be considered at informal consultation meeting on the 20 th June 2023	
BCP-121	 Act with integrity Treat all persons fairly and with respect Breach of Nolan principles. 	Referred to monitoring officer for initial assessment. Subject councillor's response to complaint sought and obtained.	Pending
		Complaint now due to be considered by the new Chair in consultation on the 20 th June 2023	
BCP-126	 Failing to treat others with respect Bullying any person Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity 	The complaint was initially assessed by the Monitoring Officer and referred to the Chair for consideration in consultation. Chair determined part of the complaint upheld	Determined Subject Councillor apologised at Full Council on the 21 st march 2023
BCP 127	 Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute while acting in an official capacity Failing to treat others with respect 	The complaint was initially assessed by the Monitoring Officer. Referred to the subject Councillor for a response and will then be referred to the Chair for consideration in consultation.	Determined
BCP 128	 Incorrect use of call- in for a planning application 	The complaint was initially assessed by the Monitoring Officer and referred to the Chair for	Determined

Reference	Nature of allegation	Outcome / Decision	Status
		consideration. Chair determined complaint not upheld. Subject Councillor and Complainant advised.	
BCP 128A	 Failure to respond to emails 	Referred to monitoring officer. Informal resolution agreed. Complainant to be advised.	Determined
BCP 130	 Failure to treat others with respect 	Referred to monitoring officer. Informal resolution agreed. Complainant to be advised.	Determined
BCP 131	 Failure to treat others with respect Intimidating or attempting to intimidate 	The complaint was initially assessed by the Monitoring Officer and referred to the Chair for consideration in consultation. Chair determined complaint upheld. Subject Councillor and	Determined Subject councillor made apology at Full Council
		complainant advised of outcome.	
BCP 132	 Misuse of public funds 	The complaint was assessed by the Monitoring officer and referred to independent complaint.	Determined
		Determined by Standards Committee. Complaint upheld.	
BCP 133	 Failure to treat others with respect 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer for initial assessment	Determined
		Considered by the Chair in consultation and complaint dismissed. Subject	

Reference	Nature of allegation	Outcome / Decision	Status
		Councillor and complainant advised.	
BCP 134	Breach of Code for failure to comply with sanctions imposed	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and considered by the Chair in consultation. Complaint dismissed as substantially similar to previous complaint	Determined
BCP 135	 Compromising or attempting to compromise impartiality Failure to declare a personal interest 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and considered by the Chair in consultation. Complaint not upheld. Complainant indicated she is seeking a review and has been asked to provide any additional/fresh evidence to be considered	Determined Potential review- pending
BCP 136	 Failure to treat others with respect Acting with honest and integrity Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and considered by the Chair in consultation. Complaint dismissed as substantially similar to previous complaint	Determined
BCP 137	 Bullying and intimidating Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and considered by the Chair in consultation. Complaint dismissed as substantially similar to previous complaint	Determined
BCP 138	Detail of breach not clear	Complaint referred to monitoring officer. Dismissed as detail of breach not clear and	Determined

Reference	Nature of allegation	Outcome / Decision	Status
		appeared to be a police matter	
BCP 139	 Compromising impartiality. Bringing the Council into disrepute Using the office of Councillor improperly to confer advantage 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and to be considered by the Chair in consultation. Subject Councillor asked for a response	Pending- complaint response received during pre- election period so could not be considered earlier. Due to be considered by the Chair in consultation on the 20 th June 2023, directly after the formal standards meeting
BCP 140	 Using the position of councillor to confer advantage; In respect of a prejudicial interest, failing to withdraw from the room or chamber; exercising executive functions; or seeking to improperly influence a decision 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and to be considered by the Chair in consultation. Subject Councillor asked for a response	Pending- complaint response received during pre- election period so could not be considered earlier. Due to be considered by the Chair in consultation on the 20 th June 2023, directly after the formal standards meeting
BCP 141	 Failing to treat others with respect, Bullying, intimidating or attempting to intimidate; Unlawfully disclosing confidential information or information believed to be of a confidential 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and to be considered by the Chair in consultation. Subject Councillor asked for a response.	Pending- complaint response received during pre- election period so could not be considered earlier. Due to be considered by the Chair in

Reference	Nature of allegation	Outcome / Decision	Status
	 nature, bringing into disrepute, Using or attempting to use the position as a Councillor improperly to confer on or secure an advantage or disadvantage for him or herself or anyone else 		consultation on the 20 th June 2023, directly after the formal standards meeting
BCP 142	 failing to treat others residents with respect intimidating of attempting to intimidate bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and to be considered by the Chair in consultation. Subject Councillor asked for a response	Pending- complaint response received during pre- election period so could not be considered earlier. Due to be considered by the Chair in consultation on the 20 th June 2023, directly after the formal standards meeting
BCP 143	 Failing to treat others with respect Using or attempting to use the position as a Councillor improperly to confer on or secure an advantage or disadvantage for him or herself or anyone else 	Complaint withdrawn by complainant as subject councillor not re-elected	Withdrawn
BCP 144	 Failing to treat others with respect Intimidating or attempting to intimidate Bringing the office of Councillor into disrespect while 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and will be considered by the Chair in consultation. Subject Councillor has responded	Pending- complaint response received during pre- election period so could not be considered earlier. Due to

Reference	Nature of allegation	Outcome / Decision	Status
	acting as an official capacity		be considered by the Chair in consultation on the 20 th June 2023, directly after the formal standards meeting
BCP 145	 Failing to treat others with respect Using or authorising the use of the Councils resources improperly for political purposes Bringing the office of Councillor or the Council into disrepute 	Complaint withdrawn by complainant as subject councillor not re-elected	Withdrawn
BCP 146	 Failing to treat others with respect Bullying Intimidating or attempting to intimidate Using or attempting to use the position as a Councillor improperly to confer advantage 	Complaint referred to monitoring officer and will be considered by the Chair in consultation. Subject Councillor written to and asked for a response	Pending

Summary of financial implications

10. There are no financial implications arising from this report.

Summary of legal implications

11. The Council has a legal duty to respond to complaints made against councillors of allegations of a breach of the Code of Conduct. The Council has adopted procedures for handling complaints.

Summary of human resources implications

12. There are no direct manpower implications arising from this report, however, the Committee will be aware that the handling and processing of complaints is resource intensive. A high volume of complaints could require the need for additional resources. It is therefore critical that the committee continuously seeks to promote and maintain high standards of conduct by all councillors to help limit the number of complaints.

Summary of sustainability impact

13. There are no sustainability implications arising from this report.

Summary of public health implications

14. There are no public health and wellbeing implications arising from this report.

Summary of equality implications

15. This report is reporting on the outcome of complaints made against councillors for alleged breaches of the Councillor's Code of Conduct and as a consequence there are no direct equalities implications arising from this report. The Code of Conduct includes a duty upon all councillors to promote equalities and to not discriminate unlawfully against any person. Equality implications are considered as an integral part of the complaints process.

Summary of risk assessment

16. There are no direct risks associated with this report.

Background papers

There are no background papers

Appendices

There are no appendices to this report.